



08, 09, 10 e 11 de novembro de 2022
ISSN 2177-3866

Violence against Women: Explaining the Existence of Pro-Women Institutions in Brazilian Municipalities

ADALMIR DE OLIVEIRA GOMES

UNIVERSIDADE DE BRASÍLIA (UNB)

MARIA BEATRIZ DE AZEVEDO REIS

UNIVERSIDADE DE BRASÍLIA (UNB)

CLAUDIA NANCY AVELLANEDA

INDIANA UNIVESITY

MARIANA CARNEIRO FRAGA

UNIVERSIDADE DE BRASÍLIA (UNB)

VIOLENCE AGAINST WOMEN: EXPLAINING THE EXISTENCE OF PRO-WOMEN INSTITUTIONS IN BRAZILIAN MUNICIPALITIES

Introduction

The United Nations (UN, 2020) defines violence against women as any act of gender-based violence that results in or is likely to result in physical, sexual, or mental harm or suffering to women, including threats of such acts, coercion, or arbitrary deprivation of freedom, whether in public or private life. Brazil lives with a high level of violence against women, as shown by national (IPEA, 2021) and international data (<https://www.womanstats.org/>).

Many Brazilian municipalities have adopted as a strategy to combat violence against women to support and encourage the creation of pro-women institutions (PWI). Examples of these institutions include the municipal secretariats for women's rights, police stations specializing in women and reference centers for women (Brazil, 2011; Gomes & Avellaneda, 2021). Some studies (Gomes & Avellaneda, 2021; Arvate, Cabral, McGahan & Reis, 2022) show that these institutions can generate several positive results, such as an increase in complaints and records of violence, which may indicate greater trust by women who are abused in institutions. of justice for the communities where they exist, the reduction of cases of violence, and the support to women victims of violence.

Even with evidence that PWI are effective policies to combat violence and support victims, many municipalities are unable or choose not to adopt such institutions. The creation and maintenance of some PWI depends on the approval of municipal and state laws, which can make adoption even more difficult, as in addition to financial and personnel resources, political will and social participation are also required.

The present study seeks evidence that shows how local governments make decisions about how to tackle the problem of violence against women. The question that motivates this research can be posed as follows: Why do some municipalities have pro-women institutions (PWI) while others do not? Based on this question, **the objective of this study is to test factors that influence the existence of pro-women institutions (PWI) in Brazilian municipalities.**

The study tests three different hypotheses for the research question, all of which are supported by previous theories and studies. The first hypothesis (H1) is based on the theory of rational choice in public policies and says that PWIs are created in municipalities that have higher rates of violence against women, that is, public agents seek the most rational and efficient way to Achieve your goals. The second hypothesis (H2), based on feminist theory, maintains that the creation of PWIs depends on the cultural, economic, and social conditions of the local female population. The third hypothesis (H3), based on the theory of political representation, argues that the political representation of women in local governments influences the existence of PWIs.

To test the hypotheses, an inferential study was carried out with official secondary data collected in different databases, such as IBGE, TSE and DATASUS. The data refer to all 853 municipalities in the state of Minas Gerais (MG). The choice of MG for this research is because the state is one of the most populous and rich in the country, and with the largest number of municipalities. In addition, MG was the state that had the highest absolute number of homicides of women in 2021 in the country (IPEA, 2021).

Preliminary results seem to support hypotheses 1 and 2, indicating that the existence of PWI in the studied municipalities is influenced by the level of violence in the municipality and by the economic and social conditions of the female population. On

the other hand, the results do not support hypothesis 3, that is, the political representation of women in the municipalities seems to have no effect on the existence of PWIs.

Violence against women and pro-women institutions

The term ‘violence against women’ has been approached differently in the literature. Some scholars emphasize the context of violence, as is the case of Aizer (2010) and Anderberg et al. (2013), others emphasize the specific act that characterizes violence, such as Watts and Zimmerman (2002), and still others focus on the victim and the consequences of violence as, for example, Smith (1994) teaches. However, according to the UN Declaration on the Elimination of Violence against Women (1993, p. 2), violence against women means “sexual or psychological harm or suffering to women” (1993, p. 2). In 1979, the United Nations General Assembly adopted the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women, often referred to as an International Bill of Rights for Women, ratified by Brazil in 1984.

As for the results of female homicides, in a ranking of eighty-three countries, Brazil is the fifth where most women are killed, being among the most violent in the world in this aspect and in a worse position than its neighbors in South America (except for Colombia), than European countries (except for Russia), than all African countries and even all Arab countries (United Nations, 2016).

Violence in Brazil persists, despite the country having adopted many laws and institutions that sought to protect women from domestic and general violence and punish perpetrators. Just to illustrate, some initiatives can be highlighted, such as the online Women’s Defense Police Station, in municipalities of São Paulo; the Woman Free from Violence Project, in Minas Gerais; the Victim Assistance Center of the Public Ministry, in Acre; and the Protected Woman Program, in Paraíba (Velasco & Caesar, 2021). What these institutions have in common is the fight against violence against women. The following section presents one of the main strategies to combat violence against women in Brazil, especially in municipalities, which consists of creating and maintaining pro-women institutions.

Several Brazilian municipalities have adopted as a strategy to combat violence against women to support and encourage the creation of pro-women institutions, or PWIs (Gomes & Avellaneda, 2021), such as, for example, the municipal secretariat for women’s rights, women’s police stations, reference for women, shelters for women in situations of violence, among others (Brazil, 2011).

The goals of PWIs involve preventing violence, fighting crime, punishing perpetrators, and supporting and supporting victims. Some studies (Gomes & Avellaneda, 2021) show that PWIs can generate positive results, either in the increase of complaints and records of violence, which may indicate greater trust by women who are victims of violence in the justice institutions for the communities where they exist, or in the community itself. reduction in cases of violence.

PWIs are institutions created by governments and non-governmental organizations (NGOs) to promote gender equality, protecting women’s rights through legal and formal tools. Regarding the types of PWIs, there are government institutions, with centers specializing in women’s care being implemented, as well as shelters, temporary shelters, specialized police stations for women’s care (DEAMs), centers or service centers for women in common police stations, public defenders’ offices and women’s defenders’ offices (specialized), specialized courts for domestic and family violence against women, specialized prosecutors, general health services and health services aimed at treating cases of sexual and domestic violence. Regarding non-

governmental organizations, reference centers can be highlighted, which aggregate different types of services provided by a multitude of NGOs to women victims of violence.

It is possible to observe that the PWIs, whether governmental or not, are an important advance for municipalities in the search for the effective protection of women from violence. Despite the many advances, there is still a long way to go for women in the pursuit of dignity, respect, and equality. Violence against women is one of the main forms of violation of human rights. In view of this, it is up to government officials to create institutions that efficiently combat all kinds of violence against women (Gomes & Avellaneda, 2020).

Even with evidence that PWIs are effective policies to combat violence and support victims (Gomes & Avellaneda, 2021; Arvate et al., 2022), many municipalities are unable or choose not to adopt such institutions. The creation and maintenance of some PWIs depend on the approval of municipal and state laws, which can make adoption even more difficult, as in addition to financial and personnel resources, political will and social participation are also needed. The present study seeks evidence that shows how local governments make decisions about how to tackle the problem of violence against women. The question that motivates this research can be posed as follows: Why do some municipalities have PWIs while others do not?

The first hypothesis holds that PWI are created and maintained in places that have higher rates of violence against women. Violence against women is widely seen as a fundamental human rights issue. Many national governments and international organizations have taken a wide variety of measures to address violence against women, including legal reforms, public education campaigns, and support for shelters and centers (Htun & Weldon, 2012). Political agencies can help put the issue of violence against women on the public agenda by providing research and other institutional support that helps movements to influence government (Htun & Weldon, 2012).

Thus, the PWIs are created to answer the following problem: the greater the number of reports of violence, the more essential is the creation of some pro-women institution. According to Gomes & Avellaneda (2021), to solve the fight against violence against women around the world, governments and non-governmental organizations (NGOs) have adopted and created PWI in order to provide gender equality, protecting women's rights through legal and formal tools. Therefore, more PWIs should empower women to speak up and report their experiences in relation to domestic violence and violence in general. Women's perception of and trust in their local governments should be influenced by the number and type of PWIs (Gomes & Avellaneda, 2020). Consequently,

H1: In municipalities with higher rates of violence against women, the probability of having pro-women institutions is higher, compared to municipalities with lower rates of violence.

The second hypothesis argues that the creation and maintenance of PWIs in municipalities depend on the economic and social conditions of the resident female population. Several studies have found positive relationships between women's economic disadvantage and violence against women (Benson, Fox, Demaris & Van Wyk 2003; Lauritsen & White 2001). Although violence is perpetrated against all groups of women in society, some theories argue that the levels of violence experienced by women differ depending on their economic and social characteristics, such as age, ethnicity, education, marital status, and economic status (Mouzos & Makkai, 2009).

According to feminist theory, violence against women follows from gender inequality at the social level (Bograd, 1988). Thus, the more unequal the relationships between women and men in a community, the more violent men are likely to be towards women (Yodanis, 2004). Yet, according to feminist theory, we should expect to find the following patterns across countries: (a) the higher the educational, occupational, and political status of women, the lower the rates of physical and sexual violence, and (b) the lower the rates of violence, the lower the fear of women in relation to the status of men (Yodanis, 2004).

Cross-cultural studies claim that cultural norms endorse what they call ‘male domination’, a process involving female economic dependence, which generates patterns of conflict resolution emphasizing violence, harshness, and honor (Heise, 1998). Theorists along these lines also hold that traditional male authority in the family predicts high social levels of domestic violence and rape (Levinson, 1989).

The socioeconomic conditions of women are also influenced by social and legal norms, as they can generate conditions that favor the most vulnerable women to be exposed to violence, in addition to making violators more prone to abusive behavior, given the expectation of impunity (WHO, 2021). There is a two-way relationship between economic development and women’s empowerment, based on how to improve women’s ability to access elements of development such as health, education, rights, and political participation (Duflo, 2012). According to Miles-Dan (1998), neighborhoods with severe resource deprivation have dramatically higher rates of partner violence. In addition, poor neighborhoods, measures of poverty level and income inequality, have higher rates of violence against women. Thus, economic and social development can play an important role in reducing gender inequality.

Women’s social and economic relationships have a strong relationship with issues of race and ethnicity. In other words, race and ethnicity tend to correlate with economic factors because black women tend to be economically poor and, as a result, have less institutional support. Under these conditions, the stimulus and ability of women to report crimes ends up diminishing (Nagel et al., 2005). Studies show that racial discrimination helps the propagation of social relationships and institutional structures that perpetuate attitudes of violence towards women (Flood & Pease, 2009). Therefore, our second hypothesis states the following,

H2: In municipalities with women in better economic and social conditions, the probability of having pro-women institutions is higher, compared to municipalities with women in worse economic and social conditions.

The third hypothesis argues that the local political representation of women directly influences the existence of PWI. According to Yodanis (2004), the lack of representation of women in political systems contributes to a society in which men can use physical violence without fear of penalty. The same author argues that female power within political organizations could have greater scope in the establishment of policies to combat violence by men against women, as well as in measures to punish aggressors and support victims (Yodanis, 2004).

The most important changes expected with the entry of women into public office would be those that support the goals of greater autonomy for women, recognizing and correcting gender inequality. The idea that increased representation of women has the potential to change policy has public repercussions (Norris & Lovenduski, 1995). Political status provides women with access to power and representation in the state (Bradley & Khor, 1993). Changes in the relative position of women, the agenda of

organized movements active in the State and the growing presence of feminism in Brazilian society have placed gender agendas at the center of political dispute (Biroli, 2016).

The theory of women's political representation supports this third hypothesis. The main concepts of this theory deal with passive representation and active representation. Passive representation is the fair proportion of representation in political office of populations that are traditionally marginalized and underrepresented in society, as in the case of women. Active representation happens when demographic characteristics shared between politicians and the public result in the promotion and adoption of programs and policies that benefit the specific population represented (Bishu & Kennedy, 2019).

In other words, passive representation is the election of women to political office, and active representation is the result of passive representation in policies and institutions that effectively favor women. Thus, it is expected that with more women exercising political leadership positions in the municipalities (passive representation), the greater the chances of existing PWIs in the municipalities (active representation), as presented in the following hypothesis.

H3: In municipalities with greater political representation of women, the probability of having pro-women institutions is greater, compared to municipalities with less political representation of women.

Method

The present study is quantitative and counts on the analysis of secondary data through statistical techniques. The secondary data used in the research refer to all 853 municipalities in the state of Minas Gerais (MG). We chose MG since the state is one of the most populous and rich in the country, and with the largest number of municipalities. In addition, MG had the highest absolute number of homicides of women in 2018 (IPEA, 2018), and some evidence seems to show that victims are unaware of the seriousness of the situation. According to the Diagnosis of Domestic and Family Violence Against Women, carried out by the Public Ministry of the State of Minas Gerais, more than 90% of victims of femicide in the state had not requested any type of urgent protective measure (MPMG, 2018).

The dependent variables of the survey are five pro-women institutions (PWI): (a) Municipal Council for Women's Rights, (b) Municipal Plan for Women, (c) Secretariat of Women, (d) Reference Center for Women, and (e) Shelter for women in situations of violence. All these variables are dichotomous (dummy), that is, they inform whether the municipality has PWI. In addition, a sixth dependent variable was created, called (f) Total PWI, which consists of the sum of all existing PWIs in the municipality, ranging, therefore, from 0 to 5. Data on PWIs were collected in the Information Survey Municipal Basics - MUNIC, from IBGE, referring to the year 2018.

The independent variables were divided into three categories, according to the hypotheses established in the research. The first category consists of the variables of violence against women, with three different variables: (a) number of homicides of women per group of 100,000 women, between 2009 and 2018, according to the ICD-10 international classification, codes X85 to Y09 and Y35 to Y36, which covers violent deaths of women caused by assault and other violent deaths classified as homicides; (b) municipality with homicide of women, a dichotomous variable that divides municipalities into two categories – with and without homicides of women, considering the period from 2009 to 2018; and (c) number of aggression against women per group of 100,000 women,

between 2009 and 2018, according to the ICD-10 international classification, considering only cases of aggression that were registered in health facilities. These data on violence and homicides against women were collected from DATASUS, a database of the Unified Health System (*Sistema Único de Saúde - SUS*).

The second group of independent variables consists of women's economic and social conditions. For this, two variables were used, the first is (d) female monthly income, which consists of the average monthly income, in reais, of the population of economically active women in the municipality; and the second variable is (e) proportion of women with higher education in the municipality. The two variables were collected in the 2010 IBGE Census. The unavailability of annual data at the municipal level in Brazil is a research limitation, however the socioeconomic data referring to women should not change significantly over time, since the differences between municipalities tend to remain over time, as crises and economic growth affect all municipalities (Gomes & Avellaneda, 2020).

Finally, the third category of independent variables consists of the political representation of women in the municipality. Two variables were used, the first is a dichotomous variable for the existence of (f) a female mayor in the municipality, and the second a (g) percentage of female councilors in the municipality. The variables deal with the two most important elective positions in Brazilian municipalities. The data were collected on the website of the Superior Electoral Court (*Tribunal Superior Eleitoral - TSE*), the highest body of the Electoral Justice in Brazil.

Several variables were used as controls in the research: (a) total population; (b) percentage of black population; (c) percentage of Catholic population; (d) percentage of rural population; (e) Gross Domestic Product – GDP per capita, in reais (R\$); (f) number of NGOs that work directly in defense of human rights and/or social rights in support of women at risk, per group of 100,000 inhabitants; (g) conservative mayor (dichotomous variable); and (h) percentage of votes received by the mayor. Variables (a), (b), (c), (d) and (e) were collected in the 2010 Brazilian Census; the variable referring to NGOs was collected in the database of Private Foundations and Non-Profit Associations – FASFIL, also from IBGE, with data corresponding to 2018; and political variables were collected on the TSE website. Table 1 presents the descriptive statistics of all the variables used.

Table 1. Descriptive statistics of the research variables

Variable	Mean	S.d.	Minimum	Maximum
Dependent variables				
Council ^d	0.18	0.38	0	1
Plan ^d	0.01	0.13	0	1
Secretariat ^d	0.08	0.27	0	1
Reference center ^d	0.13	0.34	0	1
Shelter ^d	0.01	0.12	0	1
Total PWI	0.43	0.86	0	5
Independent variables				
Women's homicides	3.24	2.78	0	20.90
Municipality with w. homicide ^d	0.82	0.38	0	1
Aggression by women	5.43	5.23	0	39.32
Female monthly income	619.16	136.00	382.76	1588.32
Women with higher education	4.75	1.89	0.86	16.88
Mayor woman ^d	0.08	0.27	0	1
Women councilors (%)	11.33	10.33	0	55.56
Control variables				
Total population	24666.66	100084.68	786	2501576
Black population (%)	56.62	18.70	11.19	93.60
Catholic population (%)	76.34	10.90	27.36	97.46
Rural population (%)	30.79	18.44	0	78.31
GPD per capita	8705.34	8066.02	2771.51	121262.91
Human rights NGOs	0.58	0.62	0	5.04
Conservative mayor ^d	0.81	0.38	0	1
Mayor votes (%)	56.62	12.84	22.42	100.00

^d Dichotomous variable (*dummy*)

All study variables were correlated; this analysis helped to define the estimated regression models in the following analyses. Each of the dependent variables was analyzed using a regression model, and the results are presented in the following section.

Results

For each dependent variable of the research, we estimated a regression model. Thus, for the first five models, referring to the dichotomous variables that represent the PWI, logistic regression was used; and, in the final model, referring to the Total PWI, conventional linear regression was used, based on the Ordinary Least Squares Method (OLS). Before estimating the regression models, several tests were performed on the data to verify the assumptions of normality, homoscedasticity, and multicollinearity. The results did not indicate problems in this sense that could compromise the results. Table 2 presents the results of the estimated regression models.

Table 2. Regression analysis results

Independent variables	Dependent variables					
	Council	Plan	Secretariat	Center	Shelter	Total PWI
Women's homicides	-.012 (.005) *	-.001 (.001)	-.003 (.003)	.006 (.004) **	7.91e-4 (.001)	-.023 (.010) *
Municipality with w. homicide	.116 (.037) **	.006 (.013)	.054 (.027) *	.113 (.032)	-.002 (.012)	.289 (.074) **
Aggression by women	1.78e-4 (.002)	8.37e-5 (8.13e-4)	.002 (.001)	.002 (.002)	5.87e-5 (7.43e-4)	.004 (.004)
Female monthly income	6.49e-4 (1.8e-4) **	-1.06e-5 (6.2e-5)	3.42e-4 (1.3e-4) *	5.32e-4 (1.5e-4) **	1.85e-4 (5.7e-5) **	.001 (3.5e-4) **
Women with higher education	.026 (.010) *	.003 (.003)	.014 (.007)	.027 (.009) **	4.19e-4 (.003)	.072 (.021) **
Mayor woman	-.039 (.044)	-.014 (.015)	-.006 (.032)	.003 (.038)	.004 (.014)	-.021 (.087)
Women councilors	-9.78e-4 (.001)	-9.96e-4 (4.07e-4) *	-8.17e-4 (8.61e-4)	-.001 (.001)	2.69e-4 (3.72e-4)	-.003 (.002)
Control variables						
Total population	4.02e-7 (1.3e-7) **	4.49e-7 (4.8e-8) **	3.83e-7 (1.0e-7) **	4.95e-7 (1.2e-7) **	5.30e-7 (4.4e-8) **	2.26e-6 (2.7e-7) **
Black population	.005 (7.9e-4) **	8.44e-5 (2.76e-4)	.002 (5.8e-4) **	.002 (6.9e-4) **	3.64e-4 (2.53e-4)	.010 (.001) **
Catholic population	-.001 (.001)	-.001 (4.63e-4) *	-.001 (9.79e-4)	-.001 (.001)	-3.55e-4 (4.23e-4)	-.006 (.002) *
Rural population	-.001 (9.12e-4)	-1.41e-4 (3.17e-4)	-9.46e-5 (6.70e-4)	-.001 (7.92e-4)	4.19e-4 (2.90e-4)	-.002 (.001)
GPD per capita	-2.54e-6 (1.69e-6)	-7.34e-8 (5.89e-7)	-5.99e-7 (1.25e-6)	-9.14e-7 (1.47e-6)	-5.44e-7 (5.38e-7)	-4.67e-6 (3.32e-6)
Human rights NGOs	-.001 (.020)	-.005 (.007)	.003 (.015)	-.007 (.017)	.005 (.006)	-.006 (.040)
Conservative mayor	-.032 (.031)	-.007 (.010)	-.003 (.022)	-.015 (.026)	-.009 (.009)	-.066 (.060)
Mayor votes	-.001 (9.41e-4)	7.99e-4 (3.27e-4) *	-1.77e-4 (6.92e-4)	8.64e-5 (8.17e-4)	3.07e-4 (2.99e-4)	-3.26e-5 (.001)
Intercept	-.377 (.186) *	.063 (.064)	-.235 (.137)	-.396 (.161) *	-.132 (.059) *	-1.07 (.365) **
R² adjusted	.200	.156	.122	.219	.246	.376

N=853; standard error in parentheses; * $p < .05$; ** $p < .01$

The variable homicide of women was negatively related to the existence of the municipal council for women's rights and with total PWI, but it had a positive effect on the reference center for women. The variable municipality with homicide of women, in

turn, presented a positive and statically significant value in relation to the municipal council, the secretariat and the total PWI.

The aggression of women did not show a statistically significant relationship with any of the PWIs. In summary, the rates of violence against women in the investigated municipalities seem to influence the existence of PWIs only in specific cases. Thus, hypothesis 1 is only partially supported by the results of the study. The female monthly income showed a positive value regarding all pro-women institutions, except the municipal plan for women. The variable women with higher education showed a positive effect regarding the council, the center, and the total PWI. This result indicates that the economic and social conditions of women affect the existence of PWIs in municipalities, that is, the better the conditions of women in terms of income and education, the greater the chances of having PWIs in the municipality. This result therefore supports hypothesis 2.

The explanations for these results are varied, but, in general terms, women's access to income can generate greater autonomy, thus reducing the barriers that often prevent the reporting of the violence suffered (Bhattacharya et al., 2009). Education makes women aware of their rights and able to demand and pressure their representatives so that these rights are respected (Gomes & Avellaneda, 2021). Economic and social development can play an important role in reducing gender inequality. The result is in accordance with the feminist theory that presents the relationship of gender inequality as a decisive factor in violence against women.

As for the political variables, the results show that the fact that a municipality has a female mayor or female councilors does not affect the possibility of the existence of PWI. That is, none of the political variables seems to influence the creation or maintenance of PWI in the investigated municipalities. Thus, the results do not support hypothesis 3. A plausible justification for such a result may be due to the low representation of gender movements in politics. That is, even if women occupy leadership positions in local governments, they do not seem to legitimize the causes traditionally defended by gender movements, including policies for the protection and defense of women's rights (Gomes & Avellaneda, 2020). Still, the low effectiveness of gender movements in municipalities in general, and not only in the political environment, also clarifies this effect (Gomes & Avellaneda, 2021).

Among the control variables, population size showed a positive relationship with all PWIs, as expected. That is, there is a tendency for this type of institution to be created mainly in more populous cities (Gomes & Avellaneda, 2021). An interesting but unexpected result is the positive influence of the black population in the creation of four types of PWI. This fact may indicate that black women are being prioritized in policies to combat violence in Brazilian municipalities. This result seems to bring important evidence that shows changes in relation to the actions of local governments in gender and race policies, since, traditionally, as pointed out by Nagel et al. (2005), black women tend to be economically poor and, consequently, receive less institutional support.

Another expected result is the negative relationship between the Catholic population and the creation and maintenance of PWIs. The Catholicism has been characterized several times by sexist and patriarchal behavior and, in addition, male authority in the family predicts a high degree of domestic violence (Levinson, 1989; Sanday, 1981). The rural population did not show statistical significance with any of the PWIs. One possible explanation is that PWIs are predominantly urban phenomena, to which rural women do not have access or have more difficulty reporting abuse and aggression (Gomes & Avellaneda, 2021). In practice, PWIs are mainly located in urban areas. Geographic isolation and women's lack of access to PWI can make reporting

difficult (Hetling, 2000).

Final considerations

The study contributes to the limited body of empirical research on the creation and maintenance of pro-women institutions (PWI) in Brazilian municipalities. The work innovates by (a) performing analyzes of five types of PWI; (b) present several different types of variables; and (c) employ local data from the municipalities of Minas Gerais. The work tested the effect of socioeconomic and political factors of violence on the creation of PWI in the municipality of Minas Gerais. The results indicate that the socioeconomic variables showed, in general, a significant prominence in the formation of PWI, supporting the feminist theory. However, the political variables did not represent a relevant value in the construction of these institutions, not justifying the theory of bureaucratic representation.

One of the main limitations of the study is the unavailability of annual data on PWIs. The Municipal Basic Information Survey - MUNIC collects data on policies and institutions that support women in Brazilian municipalities every four years, thus restricting annual updates to the data. In addition, the sociodemographic variables, collected through the 2010 Census, which is carried out every ten years, are outdated since the 2021 Census has not yet been finalized due to the pandemic.

A research agenda resulting from this work consists of replicating the study for other Brazilian states, such as São Paulo and Rio de Janeiro, the first and third most populous states in the country, respectively. Such studies would allow a more comprehensive analysis of the creation of PWIs in Brazil. Because Brazil is a diverse and extensive nation, with 26 states, a Federal District and almost 5570 municipalities (IBGE, 2022), subsequent research should also study the conditions under which PWIs are adopted and established in Brazilian municipalities. Comparison of municipal data would be useful to understand the creation of PWI in the country.

Also, as a research agenda, it would be interesting to compare the data collected in Brazil with data from other countries such as Russia, South Africa, and Mexico, which are among the most dangerous nations for women. Finally, it would also be pertinent to carry out work on the influence of the Covid-19 pandemic on violence against women and the creation of pro-women institutions.

Reference

- Aizer, A. (2010). A diferença salarial de gênero e violência doméstica. *American Economic Review*, 100(4): 1847-1859.
- Anderberg, D., Rainer, H., Wadsworth, J., Wilson, T. (2013). *Desemprego e violência doméstica: teoria e evidência*. Série Documentos de Discussão, n. 7515. Bona: IZA.
- Arvate, P., Cabral, S., McGahan, A., Reis, P. 2022. Structural advocacy organizations and intersectional outcomes: Effects of women's police stations on female homicides. *Public Administration Review*. <https://doi.org/10.1111/puar.13478>.
- Benson, M. L., Fox, G. L., DeMaris, A., & van Wyk, J. (2003). Neighborhood Disadvantage, Individual Economic Distress and Violence Against Women in Intimate Relationships. *Journal of Quantitative Criminology*, 19(3), 207–235.
- Bhattacharya, M., Bedi, A., & Chhachhi, A. (2009). *Marital violence and women's employment and property status: evidence from north Indian villages* (p. 4361). Bonn: IZA. Discussion Paper Series.

- Biroli, F. (2016). Divisão sexual do trabalho e democracia. *Dados - Revista de Ciências Sociais*, 59 (3):719-754.
- Bishu, G. & Alexis K. (2019). Trends and gaps: a meta-review of representative bureaucracy. *Review of Public Personnel Administration*. Published online on March 19. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0734371X19830154>.
- Bograd, M. (1988). *Feminist perspectives on wife abuse: An introduction*. In K. Yllö & M. Bograd (Eds.), *Feminist perspectives on wife abuse*. Beverly Hills, CA: Sage.
- Bradley, K. & Khor, D. (1993). Toward an integration of theory and research on the status of women. *Gender & Society*, 7 (3): 347-378.
- Brasil. (2011). Secretaria de Políticas para as Mulheres. *Política Nacional de Enfrentamento à Violência Contra as Mulheres*. <https://www12.senado.leg.br/institucional/omv/entenda-a-violencia/pdfs/politica-nacional-de-enfrentamento-a-violencia-contra-as-mulheres>
- Duflo, E. (2012). Women empowerment and economic development. *Journal of Economic Literature*, 50 (4): 1051-79.
- Flood, M., & Pease, B. (2009). Factors influencing attitudes to violence against women. *Trauma, Violence & Abuse*, 10(2), 125–142.
- Gomes, A. O., & Avellaneda, C. N. (2021). The role of pro-women institutions in addressing violence reports against women. *Global Public Policy and Governance*. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s43508-021-00003->
- Heise, Lori. (1998). Violence against woman. An integrated, ecological framework. *Violence Against Women*, 4(3): 262–290.
- Hetling, A. (2000). Addressing domestic violence as a barrier to self-sufficiency: The relationship of well- fare receipt and spousal abuse. *Journal of Public and International Affairs*, 11, 21–35.
- Htun, M., & Weldon, L. (2012). The civic origins of progressive policy change: Combating violence against women from a global perspective, 1975–2005. *American Political Science Review*, 106(3), 548–569.
- IPEA – Instituto de Pesquisas Econômica Aplicada. 2021. *Atlas da Violência 2021* [Atlas of Violence 2021]. Ipea: São Paulo.
- Lauritsen, J. & White, N. (2006). Putting violence in its place: the influence of race, ethnicity, gender, and place on the risk for violence. *Criminology & Public Policy* 1(1), 37-60
- Levinson, D. (1989). *Family violence in cross-cultural perspective*. Sage Publications, Inc.
- Mouzos J. & Makkai T. (2004). *Women's experiences of male violence: findings from the Australian component of the International Violence Against Women Survey (IVAWS)*. Research and public policy series no. 56. Canberra: Australian Institute of Criminology. <https://www.aic.gov.au/publications/rpp/rpp56>
- Nagel, B., Matsuo, H., McIntyre, K., & Morrison, N. (2005). Attitudes toward victims of rape: Effects of gender, race, religion, and social class. *Journal of Interpersonal Violence*, 20(6), 725–737.

- Norris, P., Lovenduski, J. (1995) *Political Recruitment: Gender, Race and Class in the British Parliament*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Smith, M. (1994). Melhorando a qualidade dos dados da pesquisa sobre violência contra as mulheres: Uma abordagem feminista. *Gênero e Social*, 8(1): 109-127.
- Velasco, C., Caeser, G. (2021). Quatro iniciativas para o combate à violência contra a mulher; veja como elas funcionam. *GI*. <https://g1.globo.com/monitor-da-violencia/noticia/2021/08/07/quatro-iniciativas-para-o-combate-a-violencia-contra-a-mulher-veja-como-elas-funcionam.ghtml>.
- Watts, C, & Zimmerman, C. (2002). Violência contra as mulheres: escopo global e magnitude. *The Lancet*, 359(9313): 1232-1237.
- World Health Organization. (2021). *Violence against women*. <https://www.who.int/news-room/fact-sheets/detail/violence-against-women>.
- Yodanis C. (2004). Gender inequality, violence against women, and fear: a cross-national test of the feminist theory of violence against women. *Journal of Interpersonal Violence*, 19(6), 655–675.