

Website disclosure index for Non-Profit Organizations: an investigation into the Brazilian reality

DANIEL FERREIRA DE QUEIROZ

UNIVERSIDADE FEDERAL DA PARAÍBA (UFPB)

VIVIANE DA COSTA FREITAG

UNIVERSIDADE FEDERAL DA PARAÍBA (UFPB)

GABRIEL BERNARDES BRASILEIRO

UNIVERSIDADE FEDERAL DA PARAÍBA (UFPB)

Website disclosure index for Non-Profit Organizations: an investigation into the Brazilian reality

Abstract: Non-Profit Organizations are recognized for their work in promoting social change in scenarios not achieved by the public and/or private sectors. Such entities need to adopt practices that involve fundraising to fulfill their social objectives, as well as the disclosure of results, as a form of accountability. In this context, the Internet is a potential mean of communication between non-profit organizations and stakeholders. Therefore, the objective of this investigation is to measure the disclosure index practiced on the internet pages of non-profit organizations that are certified as Social Assistance Charitable Entities (CEBAS) located in the state of Paraíba, Brazil. This quantitative documentary research verified, on the website of the 16 entities eligible for the study, the presence/absence of elements relating to the disclosure of the organizational, financial and operational aspects developed. The results reflect efficiency in the presentation of operational data; however, they point to a certain weakness in demonstrating financial and operational aspects, thus revealing gaps in management and transparency process of these organizations. This fact demonstrates the need to adopt transparent practices through websites, aiming to enhance the financial and organizational sustainability of these entities.

Key words: Disclosure. Non-profit Organizations. CEBAS

1. Introduction

Non-Profit Entities are recognized for their work in promoting social change in scenarios not achieved by the public and/or private sectors (Barragato, 2019; Khieng, 2014). Even if constituted as a private company, these entities are characterized by their public character, since they prioritize collective values and do not have profit as their main purpose, but as a mean to carry out its social activities (Lacruz, 2020). These organizations face a series of challenges in relation to different economic sectors, considering the need for voluntary contributions, coming from individuals and/or legal entities, to guarantee their organizational sustainability.

Faced with these adverse scenarios, it is understood that these organizations need to adopt practices that include, from fundraising, even with a minimal surplus, until its conscious use (Oliveira & Afonso, 2020), with a view to carrying out activities that, in fact, fulfill its social objectives, as well as its development and continuity, and at the same time, satisfy the informational needs of its stakeholders (IBGC, 2015), among many, its donors.

Among the sources of resources raised by these organizations in the Brazilian scenario public financing stands out (Jorge & Vendruscolo, 2020), which can occur through incentives in tax waivers, or through budget transfers (Brasil, 2020). To this end, the law on the Certification of Social Assistance Charitable Entities (CEBAS) (Law 12.101/2009) enables these entities to receive government budget transfers.

Therefore, CEBAS constitutes a public policy of national range, which grants non-profit entities governed by private law, recognized as charitable social assistance entities, a certification that ensures them the right to tax immunities, established by paragraph 7 of article 195 from Brazilian Federal Constitution, also giving them priority

in the signing of agreements with public agency, in less bureaucratized processes (Pinheiro & D'Angelo, 2021; Brazil, 1988).

As compensation for obtaining this certification, it is necessary for such organizations to meet the requirements of the General Technical Interpretation (ITG)¹ 2002 from Federal Accounting Council² (CFC, 2012) as well as transparency of the actions and results employed by the organization to the various stakeholders (Costa & Pesci, 2016; Grizzle & Sloan, 2016; Boateng, Akamavi & Nodoro, 2016), this compliance is considered a determining factor for maintaining certification.

However, even though the requirement for accountability in a satisfactory, clear and accessible manner is a criteria for maintaining the certification, it is noted that some entities leave gaps in this regard, especially with regard to the dissemination of complete and quality accounting reports (Pereira et al., 2023).

To this end, it is possible to highlight the Internet as a potential mean of communication with the purpose of providing timely and transparent information, with multiple and massive access, and a relatively low cost (Santos, Ohayon & Pimenta, 2017).

In this context, the present investigation aims to measure the disclosure index practiced on the internet pages of non-profit organizations that are certified as Social Assistance Charitable Entities (CEBAS) located in the state of Paraíba, Brazil. To this end, the website of 16 entities eligible for the study were verified, during July 2023, in order to highlight the presence/absence of elements relating to the disclosure of the organizational, financial and operational aspects of those institutions.

Seeing that CEBAS constitutes a public policy for social inclusion, in the segments of education, health and assistance (Pinheiro & D'Angelo, 2021), this study becomes relevant within the accounting literature for the financial sustainability of non-profit organizations, as it raises debates regarding the formulation of public policies for such entities. Furthermore, by deepening this theme, this investigation expands discussions about the vulnerabilities of social entities, focusing on aspects concerning transparency and publication of documents relating to accountability, still considered a challenge for the management of these entities (Campos, Moreira & Scalzer, 2015), thus solidifying their image towards the external public. In academic terms, it contributes to the dissemination of good corporate governance practices applied to a specific reality, in this case, non-profit organizations.

2. Literature Review

2.1 Non-profit Organizations: Structure, organization and institutional goals

It is the State's role to be responsible for the country's economic development, promote social well-being, ensure environmental protection, among other activities related to guaranteeing fundamental rights, whether individual or collective (Brasil, 1988). However, it is possible to identify gaps in the implementation of these services in the Brazilian reality, resulting in the minimization of the quality of social life (Cardoso et al., 2020).

This situation, combined with the desire for greater activism and civil participation in tackling problems considered relevant, favored the emergence of a set of non-profit institutions, focused on collective interests, with the aim of offering contributions, aiming to alleviate certain social ills (Salamon & Sokolowski, 2018).

Non-profit organizations share common responsibilities with entities that represent state control, as well as

¹ This Technical Interpretation "establish criterion and specific procedures for evaluation, recognition of transactions and equity variations, structuring financial reports and the minimum information to be disclosed in explanatory notes of a non-profit entity.

² The Federal Accounting Council is responsible for guiding, normatizing and supervising the accounting profession in Brazil.

those in the market, considering the need to serve the population in view of the common social good, despite their private nature (Salamon & Sokolowski, 2018).

Therefore, the purpose of such organizations is not based on profit, this is merely a necessary means in carrying out their activities, which should result in the constant promotion of social changes (Salamon & Sokolowski, 2018; Slomski et al., 2012; Olak & Nascimento, 2010; Rengel et al., 2012).

Among the attributes necessary to qualify as a non-profit entity, in the Brazilian context, these needs are classified as: private institutions, not part of the state apparatus; have a non-profit purpose, without distribution of any surpluses among their owners or directors; be legally constituted and self-administered; as well as having the character of voluntariness (IBGE, 2019).

2.2 The relevance of Social Assistance Charitable Entity Certification (CEBAS) in Non-Profit Organizations

Certifications play a determining role in the management process of organizations and represent a written guarantee that ensures that a given product, process or service meets specific requirements. Its application guarantees management and governance standards in the most diverse institutions (Adena et al., 2019; Brown et al., 2017).

Regarding non-profit organizations, it is important to highlight that they play an important role in promoting social inclusion through their voluntary, philanthropic, and associative activities (Pinheiro & D'Angelo, 2021). When operating in the areas of education, health and social assistance, such organizations may qualify to receive public incentives, such as tax exemptions and immunities (Pinheiro & D'Angelo, 2021), with the Social Assistance Benevolent Entity Certification (CEBAS) being decisive for obtaining such incentives in the Brazilian context.

According to the Public Policy Monitoring and Evaluation Council of the National Comptroller General (2019) this certification is an action constituted based on a national public policy, aimed at non-profit legal entities governed by private law, recognized by charitable entities, whose purpose is based on the provision of assistance services.

In this way, by achieving and guaranteeing the maintenance of CEBAS, non-profit entities can enjoy benefits such as immunities on the payment of contributions destined for social security, such as the INSS employer quota, Contribution for Social Security Financing (COFINS), Social Contribution on Net Profit (CSLL) and the Social Integration Program (PIS) on payroll, which are types of tax obligations, as well such as, they can have access to public subsidies and government transfers, and also immunity from taxes on wealth, income or services (Brasil, 1988)

The adoption of mechanisms aimed at achieving and maintaining this certification is a fundamental requirement for the financial sustainability of Non-Profit organizations, since CEBAS assumes strategic importance for maintaining tax immunity. From this perspective, accounting controls and information transparency are crucial for the perpetuity of the operational activities of these entities, an element that represents a strong challenge for their management body (Reinhardt Junior et al., 2022) which, in return, must consider some requirements involving transparency of information, as well as compliance with the requirements presented by the General Technical Interpretation (ITG – 2002).

Therefore, in order to guarantee the achievement and maintenance of CEBAS, the entities that hold it must meet criteria, such as: be regularly constituted as a legal entity governed by private law; not have a profit purpose;

be recognized as a charitable social assistance entity with the purpose of providing services in education, health and social assistance; comply with the principle of universality; and have been operating for at least twelve months (Pinheiro & D'Angelo, 2021).

To achieve the required transparency process, in view of obtaining CEBAS, Non-Profit entities are based on: Brazilian Technical Accounting Standard (NBCT) 10.4 – Foundations; NBCT 10.18 – Trade Union Entities and Class Associations; NBCT 10.19 – Non-Profit Entities; and NBCT 19.4 – Government Grant and Assistance, for presentation of accounting reports, in accordance with the Brazilian Federal Accounting Council (CFC). Table 01 presents the Statements required from non-profit entities, relevant to maintaining this certification:

Report	Description
Balance Sheet	Quantitatively and qualitatively demonstrates, on a given date, the entity's equity, and financial position
Income Statement	Highlights the composition of the result formed in a given period of the entity's operations.
Statement of Changes in Net Equity	Highlights the changes, in nature and value, in the entity's social assets, over a given period
Explanatory Notes	Contain relevant and complementary information to that not sufficiently evidenced in the Financial Statements
Cash Flow Report	Displays the movement that occurred in the entity's cash accounts.

Fig 01. Financial Statements Required from Non-Profit Entities

Adapted from: Reinhardt Junior et al, 2022.

To this end, accounting disclosure is the mechanism commonly used by entities with the aim of elucidating their results. Therefore, the presentation of the financial statements of non-profit organizations can be considered an important indicator of the transparency of these entities (Pereira et al., 2023).

The stakeholder theory justifies the need for disclosure by non-profit organizations, as they are constantly dependent on the support of their stakeholders to achieve their social objectives (Nair et al., 2023). Furthermore, by making information available, especially those that are favorable to them, the entity tends to increase its value to interested parties (Verrecchia, 2001).

In this way, aiming for a solid basis of trust, greater legitimacy and competitive advantage over competing entities, organizations need to exercise a harmonious relationship between the subjects with which they are articulated, taking responsibility for the organization's stakeholders, whether those who exert influence on its activities, as well as those who are affected by its actions (Freeman, 1984). It is from this perspective that stakeholder theory emerges, which supports this investigation.

Danso et al. (2020) reinforced this argument by arguing that the success of the operationalization of third sector entities is directly related to their insertion in society, through the influence that exists between interested parties, since the resources necessary for the development of their activities, whether human, material or financial, are extracted from the external environment.

From the above, the relevance of CEBAS is made clear regarding fulfilling the purposes and roles played in the most diverse third sector organizations that in view of greater transparency and reliability, they should use the most varied strategies, with the aim of disseminating their actions to their stakeholders, as discussed in the following section.

2.3 Disclosure via Website of Non-Profit entities

As non-profit organizations are responsible for carrying out activities, especially of a social nature, previously granted to the State and also, as they generally receive financial resources originating from the government and donations from individuals and legal entities, they need to imbue themselves with processes of transparency so that they gain credibility before their various stakeholders, that being: beneficiaries, donors, volunteers, government, community, among other interested parties (Amorim et al., 2018; Lacruz, Rosa & Oliveira, 2023).

Thus, when disclosing information, transparency enables stakeholder participation in the organization's performance assessment process (Cabedo et al., 2017), be it financial in nature, as well as the operations carried out. In this way, disclosure relates to the disclosure of patrimonial, economic, financial, legal, physical and social information to the various stakeholders, in a way that allows them to understand and analyze the organization's current situation, helping them to decision making (Nascimento, Rabelo & Viotto, 2020).

In this regard, Reinhardt Junior et al. (2022) highlight that, as they carry out actions of public interest, Non-Profit organizations need to invest in the transparency of the activities carried out, since the resources used to finance them come from donations, grants and voluntary contributions. Furthermore, by highlighting its activities, the institution makes its actions public to society, the organization's main stakeholder, thus prioritizing the fulfillment of its social mission (Nascimento, Rabelo & Viotto, 2020), which transcends economic-financial aspects, given its wealth distribution restrictions, as well as the requirement for reinvestment of possible surpluses (Ashoka & Mckinsey, 2001).

Among the possible mechanisms for disseminating the actions and results of organizations, the internet stands out as an important vehicle, capable of informing, as well as strengthening the relationship with its stakeholders. To this end, Carvalho, Ferreira & Lima (2020) pointed out the website pages, which are useful for, in addition to presenting financial information, providing non-financial information through the dissemination of photos and videos of the actions carried out, as well as providing a space for criticism, suggestions and comments from interested individuals.

By using web pages to voluntarily disseminate information to the public, the entity provides its stakeholders with performance disclosures that provide a greater understanding of the entity's results (Nair et al., 2023).

Therefore, publishing on the web is a viable and efficient alternative when it comes to sharing information and managing the demands of interested parties. Furthermore, organizations that disseminate voluntary information on their virtual pages, whether financial or performance, demonstrate signs of efficiency and quality, as well as credibility and transparency before their stakeholders (Carvalho, Ferreira & Lima, 2020).

Although, for Third Sector entities, the disclosure of actions and accountability through their websites are not configured as mandatory procedures, their practice reveals the importance attributed to governance, voluntary disclosure, accountability and communication with stakeholders (Dumont, 2013), since it directly impacts your results, and consequently, your financial balance.

To that, Nair et al. (2023) revealed that the sustainability of non-profit organizations is directly dependent on the trust expressed to interested individuals, with strategic communication being a fundamental requirement for this achievement.

In this way, the disclosure of financial information and data related to fundraising, as well as the reliable explanation of performance, are important tools in the management of Non-Profit organizations in view of

maximizing accountability and stakeholder trust (Freeman; Phillips & Sisodia, 2020), since they often seek to attract resources to finance their actions and, consequently, guarantee the continuity of their activities.

Therefore, maintaining favorable relationships with interested parties, through sharing information and establishing trust, is a determining factor in creating value for Non-Profit organizations.

2.4 Related Studies

The study developed by Nair et al. (2023), applied to the Malaysian context, it is anchored on the premise that the sustainability of non-profit organizations directly depends on their ability to gain the trust of their stakeholders. Analysis of the official websites of these organizations revealed that a significant number, despite operating on the official web pages in a responsible manner, were not successful enough to help them gain the trust of stakeholders.

Pereira et al. (2023), analyzed the percentage of disclosure of financial statements on the websites of 88 non-profit entities qualified as social health service organizations in Brazil. The results showed that the websites of these institutions are still little used for accountability, especially for the dissemination of accounting statements. It was observed that only 28.41% of the organizations investigated published all mandatory accounting statements, while 43.18% did not disclose any of the statements in the period.

Nascimento, Rabello & Viotto (2020) evaluated the level of disclosure presented by non-profit organizations, also in the Brazilian context, and revealed that the level of disclosure of voluntary information (39%) was higher than that of a mandatory nature (2%) concluding that both the transparency and the accountability process of these institutions are impaired, showing contradictory results, as these entities should act by providing financial and performance information.

3. Research Design

Considering that the central objective of this research is to measure the disclosure index practiced on the internet pages of non-profit organizations that have CEBAS in the state of Paraíba, located in Brazil, documentary research was carried out, of a descriptive nature, with a quantitative approach, observing the procedures of Lakatos (2021). To this end, the accounting statements, work plans and other information and reports extracted from the websites of the investigated institutions were analyzed.

The universe of this research was composed of 33 non-profit organizations operating in the state of Paraíba that had, until July 23, 2023, the current Social Assistance Charitable Entity Certification (CEBAS), according to data available on the Brazilian Ministry of Development and Social Assistance, Family and Fight Against Hunger portal.

However, only 16 of these organizations maintained their own web pages, as listed in table 02, which constituted the sample for this study:

National Register of Legal Entities (CNPJ)	Institution	Website
08.329.567/0001-18	Casa do Menino	http://www.casadomenino.com.br/
08.842.657/0001-08	Associação Cultural Pisada do Sertão	https://www.pisadadosertao.org/
03.307.380/0001-08	Vila Vicentina Júlia Freire	https://vilavicentinaajp.wixsite.com/
11.534.319/0001-13	IPESQ - Instituto Professor Joaquim	https://www.ipesq.org.br/

	Amorim Neto de Desenvolvimento, Fomento e Assistência a Pesquisa Científica e Extensão	
03.303.706/0001-10	Casa da Divina Misericórdia	https://www.casadadivinamisericordia.com.br/
03.875.528/0001-00	Associação Paraibana de Equoterapia	http://www.equoterapia.aspeqpb.org.br/
70.097.894/0001-65	Associação de Pais e Amigos dos Excepcionais de Campina Grande	http://apaecampinagrande.org.br/
09.142.183/0001-54	Instituto dos Cegos da Paraíba Adalgisa Cunha	https://icpac.com.br/
10.941.315/0001-97	Centro de Formação Educativo Comunitário	https://cefecpb.com.br/
22.690.582/0001-18	ABFB Aliança Bayeux Franco-Brasileira	https://aliancabayeux.org.br/
11.287.953/0001-07	Centro Integrado de Ações Comunitárias Pela Vida	https://www.cicovi.org.br/
40.971.129/0001-61	Pia Sociedade de Pe. Nicola Mazza	https://projetoibeiradalinha.org.br/
40.970.592/0001-99	Associação Menores com Cristo	https://www.amecc.org.br/
09.282.237/0001-87	Ação Social Diocesana de Patos	https://asdppb.org/
10.733.541/0001-82	Casa Pequeno Davi	https://www.pequenodavi.org.br/
08.558.819/0001-80	Associação Promocional do Ancião Dr. João Meira de Menezes – ASPAN	https://aspan.com.br/

Fig 02. Research Sample

To collect data from the entities' respective web pages, a checklist containing 13 items was used, 07 of which refer to the entity's Organizational Aspects (AO), 04 on Financial Aspects (AF) and 02 on Operational Aspects (AOP), adapted from the study by Souza et al. (2021).

The first section, consistent with organizational aspects, covered the basic characteristics of the institutions. The second section, in turn, examined the availability of updated financial information required by Technical Standard NBC TG 26 (R5) issued by the Brazilian Federal Accounting Council – Presentation of Financial Statements and ITG 2002 (R1) – Non-Profit Entity: Balance Sheet (BP), Statement of Income (DRE), Statement of Changes in Net Equity (DMPL), Explanatory Notes (NE) and Statement of Cash Flows (DFC), as well as other financial reports, such as an Opinion Audit and Funding Sources. Finally, section three observed the presence or absence of the operational aspects of the entities, regarding the presentation of programs and projects carried out.

To verify transparency on the websites of the organizations studied, the items described in table 03 adapted from the study by Souza et al. (2021):

ORGANIZATIONAL ASPECTS (OA)
1. Are the by-laws published in the website?
2. Does the website identify the Management Team (Associates, Board of Directors, Fiscal Council and Executive Coordination)?
3. Does the website present awards, certifications, and registration with councils that the organization has?
4. Does the website presents the entity history?
5. Does the website presents the entity goal, as well as its mission/vision/values?
6. Does the website indicates where the entity is located and how to contact it?
7. Does the website inform the organization's CNPJ?
FINANCIAL ASPECTS (FA)

8. Does the site present reports required by the General Technical Interpretation ITG (2002)? (BP, DRE, DMPS, NE, DFC)
9. Does the website specify or inform the organization's sources of fundraising?
10. Does the website publish the Audit Opinion?
11. Are the reports presented up to date?
OPERATIONAL ASPECTS (OPA)
12. Does the website present the programs and projects carried out?
13. Does the website have illustrations/videos about carrying out your activities?

Fig 03. Checklist of online information dissemination indicators

Adapted from: Souza et al., 2021

The checklist items were evaluated in spreadsheets, assigning a weight of 1 to the items that the institutions published on their website, and a weight of 0 to the missing items. Such data were analyzed using simple descriptive statistics, calculating the disclosure index per entity, the percentage of disclosure per item, as well as the average disclosure for each item, represented in tables.

4. Results

Aiming to achieve the objective proposed by the research, the internet pages of the 16 entities that made up the sampling base of this study were consulted, with emphasis on the organizational, financial and operational aspects disclosed on the institutions' websites.

Regarding organizational, financial and operational aspects. Initially, we sought to highlight the disclosure used by the investigated institutions regarding organizational aspects, the results of which are shown in table 01:

Table 1

Organizational Aspects

Items	Presented (1)		Absent (0)	
	<i>fi</i>	%	<i>fi</i>	%
1 Bylaws	05	31,25%	11	68,75%
2 Management Team	11	68,75%	05	31,25%
3 Awards, Certifications and Registration	08	50%	08	50%
4 History	15	93,75%	01	6,25%
5 Goal, mission, vision, values	16	100%	00	00%
6 Location and Contact	15	93,75%	01	6,25%
7 CNPJ	08	50%	08	50%
Average Disclosure – Organizational Aspects	11,14	69,62%	4,86	30,38%

Regarding the organizational aspects disclosed on the entities' websites, there is considerable publicity regarding their history (93.75%), as well as location and forms of contact (93.75%). Such data are similar to the findings of Souza et al., (2021) who attested that the availability of this information allows donors a broader knowledge of the institution in general, from its origins to its current purposes.

In this regard, the relevance of presenting information such as the purposes, mission, vision and values of organizations, available on all websites of the observed entities, stands out. The voluntary disclosure of such data can be understood as an important tool for institutions, making them capable of generating competitive advantage and, consequently, attracting greater donations through maximizing transparency, thus contributing to strengthening

responsibility and credibility demonstrated to stakeholders (Carvalho, Ferreira & Lima, 2020).

However, among the items observed, there is a low rate of entities that provide access to their statutes on their respective web pages, given that, of the organizations surveyed, only 31.25% present such a document on the internet.

The bylaws are the instrument that elucidates important information about the full functioning of the entity, such as its purpose, sources of resources for its maintenance; administrative model; forms of association; rights and duties of members; conditions for changing statutory provisions (Brasil, 2002), among other issues consistent with its governance model. Therefore, a more expressive index was expected in this disclosure item, since the availability of this instrument, in addition to enabling greater access to the principles adopted by the entity, reflects its compliance with the recommendations of Good Governance Practices, such as: transparency, equity, accountability and corporate responsibility (IBGC, 2015).

Next, the disclosure index used by the entities analyzed was observed, regarding financial aspects. Specifically, we investigated, on the entities' virtual pages, the presentation of their financial information, regarding the exposure of the accounting reports required by ITG (2002), as well as their sources of financing, audit opinions, and whether such reports were updated (referring to the 2022 financial year), the results of which are presented in table 02:

Table 2

Financial Aspects

Items		Presented (1)		Absent (0)	
		<i>fi</i>	%	<i>fi</i>	%
8	Reports required by ITG (2002)	03	18,75%	13	81,25%
9	Fundraising Source	11	68,75%	05	31,25%
10	Audit Opinion	02	12,50%	14	87,50%
11	Up to date Reports	02	12,50%	14	87,50%
Average Disclosure – Financial Aspects		4,5	28,12%	11,5	71,88%

It is possible to perceive a certain fragility regarding the disclosure of financial aspects on the websites of the institutions investigated. Of the items analyzed, the average disclosure in this regard corresponded to only 28.12%.

According to Costa and Pesci (2016), the transparency of social organizations, in addition to observing the requirements of signed agreements and agreements, needs to be directed to other stakeholders interested in the entity's situation. Thus, accounting reports are important instruments for disseminating information to stakeholders and, consequently, maximizing transparency.

In this regard, it was observed that, of the 16 entities, only 03 made such reports available, corresponding to 18.75%. And, when investigating the presence of the audit report, this quantity revealed itself to be even lower, since only 12.5% of entities present it on their internet pages.

Carvalho, Ferreira and Lima (2020) described auditing as a tool that contributes to the quality of communication, playing an important role in disclosure practices. In this way, entities that, for a variety of reasons, do not use this practice, reveal a certain weakness in the transparency process.

When observing the presentation of all these documents, in an updated manner, a low rate was found, since only 12.5% disclosed such information regarding the last years.

In this regard, Sabino and Fonseca (2016), stated that the periodicity of accounting information is a condition for its relevance, not only in the legal aspect, but for serving stakeholders, given that they need to monitor the evolution of results, in order to verify compliance with the objectives proposed by the organization. Therefore, to obtain clear and relevant transparency, it is necessary to update these reports in a timely manner, a process not observed in most of the institutions investigated.

Finally, the disclosure index referring to the operational aspects of the observed institutions was analyzed, the results of which are condensed in table 03:

Table 3

Operational Aspects

Items	Presented (1)		Absent (0)	
	<i>f_i</i>	%	<i>f_i</i>	%
12 Programs and projects accomplished	16	100%	00	00%
13 Illustrations/videos	16	100%	00	00%
Average Disclosure – Operational Aspects	16	100%	00	00%

Regarding operational aspects, we sought to observe the presentation of programs and projects developed, as well as verifying such activities, through photographs or videos that certify their execution. In this regard, Santos, Ohayon and Pimenta (2017) emphasized that the entity can make use of the facilities and various interactive functions that the internet provides to disseminate financial and non-financial information, quickly and intensely, strengthening contact with its stakeholders via the website.

From this perspective, the dissemination of photographs and videos of the actions carried out and the people served, as well as the presentation of programs and projects that are developed by the entities, are a simple and effective way with great potential for transparency regarding execution. of activities. Regarding these aspects, it is possible to observe the disclosure of such items, in their entirety, on the websites of the organizations investigated.

Subsequently, the disclosure index was observed on the websites of the 16 entities investigated, evidenced from the organizational, financial and operational aspects, individually, the results of which are presented in table 04:

Table 4

Disclosure of investigated entities

Items	OA		FA		OPA	
	<i>f_i</i>	%	<i>f_i</i>	%	<i>f_i</i>	%
Casa do Menino	3	42,85%	1	25%	2	100%
Associação Cultural Pisada do Sertão	7	100%	4	100%	2	100%
Vila Vicentina Júlia Freire	3	42,85%	0	00%	2	100%
IPESQ - Instituto Professor Joaquim Amorim Neto de Desenvolvimento, Fomento e Assistência a Pesquisa Científica e Extensão	5	71,42%	0	00%	2	100%
Casa da Divina Misericórdia	3	42,85%	1	25%	2	100%
Associação Paraibana de Equoterapia	5	71,42%	1	25%	2	100%
Associação de Pais e Amigos dos Excepcionais de Campina Grande	6	85,71%	3	75%	2	100%
Instituto dos Cegos da Paraíba Adalgisa Cunha	3	42,85%	0	00%	2	100%
Centro de Formação Educativo Comunitário	4	57,14%	1	25%	2	100%

ABFB Alianca Bayeux Franco-Brasileira	7	100%	0	00%	2	100%
Centro Integrado de Ações Comunitárias Pela Vida	6	85,71%	1	25%	2	100%
Pia Sociedade de Pe. Nicola Mazza	4	57,14%	1	25%	2	100%
Associação Menores com Cristo	7	100%	3	75%	2	100%
Ação Social Diocesana de Patos	4	57,14%	0	00%	2	100%
Casa Pequeno Davi	7	100%	1	25%	2	100%
Associação Promocional do Ancião Dr. João Meira de Menezes – ASPAN	4	57,14%	1	25%	2	100%
Average Disclosure	4,87	69,64%	1,12	28,12%	2	100%

Among the aspects examined, the category that was most evident on the web pages of the organizations investigated was related to Operational Aspects, which reached a disclosure percentage of 100%. It is evident, therefore, that the 16 entities publish the programs and projects carried out on their websites, as well as illustrating or presenting videos that attest to the execution of their activities.

Ramos and Klann (2019) observed that the leading role of third sector entities through media resources, elucidating the execution of their activities and disseminating, to participating subjects, their daily practices, constitutes a *sine qua non* condition for their sustainability, guaranteeing them greater reliability among their stakeholders. From such practices, a new range of possibilities opens for these entities, with a view to attracting resources, whether governmental or from civil society.

Stakeholder theory, therefore, meets this practice, as it has tools that allow the establishment of trust between interested parties (Freeman, 1984), enabling entities to perform more effectively, which occurs, above all, through satisfying the interests and needs of its participants.

The disclosure of financial information, in turn, presents a much lower rate. On average, among the entities investigated, only 28.12% of the items listed in the checklist are found on their respective websites.

This percentage portrays a reality far below what was expected, therefore elucidating a low potential for financial accountability, which makes it difficult to clearly verify assets, as well as the applicability of resources in their activities, the purpose of social institutions (Lacruz, 2020). This fact also affects the fundraising potential, since the level of disclosure is directly related to the volume of donations received (Santos et al., 2017).

Therefore, the preponderant role of accounting is reaffirmed in terms of revealing transparency to resource financiers, so that such stakeholders understand its applicability through the results achieved by organizations. For this reason, the accounting disclosures of such entities should not be viewed solely as compliance with a legal requirement, but as a transparent and clear process for stakeholders, crucial to the success of the organization (Romoaldo & Santos, 2020).

In summary, it is reiterated that approximately 70% of the Organizational Aspects are met by the observed institutions, which is different from the Financial Aspects, which are not evidenced by most of the organizations investigated.

5. Conclusion

The objective of this investigation was to measure the disclosure index practiced on the internet pages of organizations that have Certification as CEBAS Social Assistance Charitable Entities, in the state of Paraíba in Brazil, in a way that ensures for these non-profit organization's greater transparency, reliability and, consequently, greater possibilities of capturing donations from public authorities, private initiatives, or civil society in general.

The literature discussed demonstrated that maintaining a favorable relationship between non-profit

organizations and interested parties, through sharing information and establishing trust, is a determining factor in creating value.

Regarding organizational aspects, the data collected pointed to the absence of statute as the biggest gap present in organizations, since elements relating to the purpose, mission, vision and values, as well as the history and location of the entity, are explained on the internet pages most of these institutions.

In relation to financial aspects, there is great weakness regarding the disclosure of important accounting documents, available in a small number of the entities investigated.

Finally, it appears that the operational aspects are met by all the institutions investigated, since the publication of such information seems decisive in the process of attracting new resources in view of the organizational sustainability, so desired by the Non-Profit entities.

As a limitation to carrying out the study, there is a certain restriction in the sample investigated, consisting of only 16 of the 33 entities holding CEBAS in the State of Paraíba, in Brazil. This fact shows that more than 50% of these organizations do not establish direct communication with their stakeholders, via internet pages, currently conceived as a determining tool in expanding this contact.

In addition to this, it is worth highlighting the fact that the research was carried out only in one federative unit in Brazil and based on obtaining a specific certification: CEBAS. If applied in other locations, or to third sector entities with different certifications, such a study may present different findings from this construction, thus representing the impossibility of generalization.

Thus, the need to develop new investigations is highlighted, in a way that allows researchers to approach third sector institutions, in order to understand the challenges encountered by the entities regarding the dissemination of their information on internet pages.

The relevance of the applicability of stakeholder theory in this study is also reiterated, which encourages an increasingly closer dialogue between third sector entities and their interlocutors, which potentially occurs through the dissemination of information and transparency, with a view to achieving greater satisfactory results for organizations and other interested parties.

Furthermore, after carrying out this study, it is recommended that the management body of third sector entities adopt transparent practices on their websites, as well as adapting them to current accounting regulations, aiming to enhance their financial and organizational sustainability.

Referências

- Adena, M., Alizade, J., Bohner, F., Harke, J., Mesters, F. (2019) Quality certification for nonprofits, charitable giving, and donor's trust: Experimental evidence. *Journal of Economic Behavior and Organization*, 159(1), 75–100.
- Amorim, A. F. A., Mendes, J. S., Pereira, L. M. L., Cavalcante, C. E. (2018) A regra do Jogo: relação entre estado e terceiro setor. *Revista de Gestão e Secretariado (Management and Administrative Professional Review)*, 9(1), 236–264.
- Ashoka Empreendedores Sociais e Mckinsey & Company Inc. (2001). *Empreendimentos sociais sustentáveis: como elaborar planos para organizações sociais*. São Paulo, Peirópolis.
- Barragato, C. A. (2019) The impact of accounting regulation on non-profit revenue recognition. *Journal of Applied Accounting Research*, 20(2), 190–206.
- Behn, B. K. B., Devries, D. D., Lin, J. (2010) The determinants of transparency in nonprofit organizations: An exploratory study. *Advances in Accounting incorporating Advances in International Accounting*, 26(4), 6–12.
- Boateng, A., Akamavi, R. K., Ndoro, G. (2016) Measuring performance of non-profit organisations: Evidence from large charities.

- Business Ethics*, 25(1), 59–74.
- Brasil. (2020) *Lei nº 14.116, de 31 de dezembro de 2020*.
- Brasil. (1988). *Constituição da República Federativa do Brasil*. Brasília, Senado Federal.
- Brown, A. L., Meer, J., Williams, J. F. (2017). Social distance and quality ratings in charity choice. *Journal of Behavioral and Experimental Economics*, 66(1), 9–15.
- Cabedo, J. D., Fuertes-Fuertes, I., Maset-Llaudes, A., Tirado-Beltrán, J. M. Improving and measuring transparency in NGOs: A disclosure index for activities and projects. *Nonprofit Management and Leadership*, 28(1).
- Campos, G. M., Moreira, R. L., Scalzer, R. S. (2014). Financial Reporting: Reflection on Transparency in the Third Sector. *Sociedade, Contabilidade e Gestão*, 9(3), 130-142.
- Cardoso, V. V., Mueller, A. A., Siqueira, C. S., Finkler, M. C. C. (2020) A relação estado e terceiro setor no Brasil: elementos basilares e premências investigativas. *DRd - Desenvolvimento Regional em debate*, 10(1) 730–750.
- Carvalho, A., Ferreira, M.R., Lima, S. (2020) Web disclosure of institutional information in nonprofit organizations: an approach in Portuguese charities. *Int Rev Public Nonprofit Mark.* 17(1), 41–58.
- Conselho Federal de Contabilidade. (2012) *ITG 2002. Entidades sem finalidade de lucros*.
- Costa, E., Pesci, C. (2016) Social impact measurement: why do stakeholders matter? *Sustainability Accounting, Management and Policy Journal*, 7(1), 99–124.
- Danso, A., Adomako, S., Lartey, T., Amankwah-Amoah, J., Owusu-Yirenkyi, D. (2020) Stakeholder integration, environmental sustainability orientation and financial performance. *Journal of Business Research*, 119(1), 652-662.
- Dumont, G. E. (2013) Nonprofit Virtual Accountability: An Index and Its Application. *Nonprofit and Voluntary Sector Quarterly*. 42(5), 1049–1067.
- Fontana, E., Schmidt, J. P. (2021) UM CONCEITO FORTE DE TERCEIRO SETOR À LUZ DA TRADIÇÃO ASSOCIATIVA. *Revista Direitos Fundamentais & Democracia*, 26(1) 278–304.
- Freeman, R. (1984) *Strategic management: a stakeholder approach*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ, Prentice Hall.
- Freeman, R. E., Phillips, R., Sisodia, R. (2020) Tensions in Stakeholder Theory. *Business & Society*, 59(2), 213–231.
- Freitas, V. P. (2020) O novo papel das empresas na proteção do meio ambiente. *Direitos Democráticos & Estado Moderno*, 1(1), 2-16.
- Grizzle, C., Sloan, M. F. (2016) Assessing changing accountability structures created by emerging equity markets in the nonprofit sector Markets in the Nonprofit Sector. *Public Administration Quarterly*, 40(2), 387–408.
- Instituto Brasileiro de Governança Corporativa (2015). *Código das melhores práticas de governança corporativa*. São Paulo, IBGC.
- Jorge, F. S., Vendruscolo, M. I. (2020) Transparência na gestão das fundações estaduais de amparo à pesquisa Brasileiras. Anais do CONGRESSO ANPCONT, Foz do Iguaçu, 14.
- Khieng, S. (2014) Funding Mobilization Strategies of Nongovernmental Organizations in Cambodia. *Voluntas*, 25(6), 1441–1464.
- Lacruz, A. J. (2020) Considerações teóricas sobre governança corporativa no terceiro setor à luz da teoria da agência. *Cad. EBAPE.BR*, 18(3), 473-485.
- Lacruz, A. J., Rosa, A. R., Oliveira, M. P. V. (2023) Efeito da governança nas doações: Evidências para organizações não governamentais ambientais Brasileiras. *Brazilian Business Review*, 20(1), 56-75.
- Lakatos, Eva M. (2021) *Técnicas de Pesquisa*. São Paulo, Grupo GEN.
- Nair, R., Arshad, R., Muda, R. et al. (2023) Web-disclosure practices for transparency and the sustainability of non-profit organisations. *Int Rev Public Nonprofit Mark*, 20(1), 1–23.
- Nascimento, R. S., Rabelo, M. M. S., Viotto, R. (2020) O nível de disclosure em Organizações do Terceiro Setor (OTS) no Estado do Ceará. *REVISTA AMBIENTE CONTÁBIL - Universidade Federal do Rio Grande do Norte*, 12(1), 234–254.

- Olak, P. A., Nascimento, D. T. (2010) *Contabilidade para entidades sem fins lucrativos (terceiro setor)*: inclui capítulos sobre contabilidade por fundos. São Paulo, Atlas.
- Oliveira, T. R., & Afonso, G. (2023). PRODUÇÃO CIENTÍFICA BRASILEIRA SOBRE O TERCEIRO SETOR NO ÂMBITO DO DIREITO ADMINISTRATIVO. *Revista Jurídica Do Nordeste Mineiro*, 2(1).
- Pereira, V. B., Oliveira, P. P., Lima, J. R., Lima, A. F. A., Guimarães, T. S. (2023) Disclosure contábil no terceiro setor: uma análise da divulgação de demonstrações contábeis em websites de entidades qualificadas como organizações sociais. *Peer Review*, 5(8), 163–182.
- Pinheiro, I. B., D'Angelo, M. J. (2021) Antecedentes e consequentes do processo de obtenção e renovação do Certificado de Entidades Beneficentes de Assistência Social (Cebas). *Revista de Educação e Pesquisa em Contabilidade (REPeC)*, 15(2), 2021.
- Ramos, F. M., Klann, R. C. (2019) Relationship between quality in accounting information and organizational characteristics of the third sector entities. *Organizações & Sociedade*, 26(88), 09–27.
- Reinhardt Júnior, R. R., Vasconcelos, A. L. F. S., Ferreira, E. B., Segura, L. C., Slomski, V. (2022) Desafios da implantação e manutenção do CEBAS para as entidades do terceiro setor. *Redeca, Revista Eletrônica do Departamento de Ciências Contábeis*, 9(1).
- Rengel, S., Cunha, P. R., Klann, R. C., Scarpin, J. E. (2013) Importância do balanço social para as entidades do terceiro setor sob a ótica dos gestores das APAES da região do Alto Vale do Itajaí/SC. *Pensar Contábil*, 14(53).
- Romoaldo, T. P. T., Santos, J. J. A. (2020) Entendimento e Aplicação da Contabilidade no Terceiro Setor: Estudo de Caso. *Revista Livre de Sustentabilidade e Empreendedorismo*, 5(5).
- Sabino, D. G., Fonseca, L. A. M. (2016) A IMPORTÂNCIA DA CONTABILIDADE NO PROCESSO DE GESTÃO DO TERCEIRO SETOR. *Revista Científica Amazônia Vida e Conhecimento*, 1(1).
- Salamon, L.M., Sokolowski, W. (2018) The Size and Composition of the European Third Sector. *The Third Sector as a Renewable Resource for Europe*. 49-94.
- Santos, C. M. V., Ohayon, P., Pimenta, M. M. (2017) Disclosure via website e as características das empresas do terceiro setor: um estudo empírico das entidades cariocas. *Advances in Scientific and Applied Accounting*, 10(1), 073–090.
- Slomski, V., Rezende, A. J., Cruz, C. V., Olak, A. (2012) *Contabilidade do Terceiro Setor*: uma abordagem operacional: aplicável às associações, fundações, partidos políticos e organizações religiosas. São Paulo, Atlas.
- Souza, L. A. P.; Lima, E. M., Vendramin, E. O., Pereira, C. A. (2021). Divulgar para quê? Índice de disclosure e a importância atribuída por doadores e gestores à divulgação voluntária de informação. *Administração Pública E Gestão Social*, 13(3).
- Tremblay-Boire, J., Prakash, A. (2015) Accountability.org: Online Disclosures by U.S. Nonprofits. *International Journal of Voluntary and Nonprofit Organizations*, 26(2), 693-719.
- Verrecchia, R. E. (2001) Essays on disclosure. *Journal of Accounting and Economics*, 32(1), 97-180.